# From Workfare to Well-Being

A Randomized Evaluation of the Effects of the STEP Labor – Intensive Public Works Program on the Urban Poor in Eastern DRC

The World Bank

The publication of this study has been made possible through a grant from the Jobs Umbrella Trust Fund, which is supported by the Department for International Development/UK AID, and the Governments of Norway, Germany, Austria, the Austrian Development Agency, and the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency.

© 2017 International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank.

1818 H Street NW, Washington, DC 20433, USA.

Telephone: 202-473-1000; Internet: www.worldbank.org.

#### Some rights reserved

This work is a product of the staff of The World Bank with external contributions. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this work do not necessarily reflect the views of The World Bank, its Board of Executive Directors, or the governments they represent. The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this work. The boundaries, colors, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this work do not imply any judgment on the part of The World Bank concerning the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

Nothing herein shall constitute or be considered to be a limitation upon or waiver of the privileges and immunities of The World Bank, all of which are specifically reserved.

#### **Rights and Permissions**



This work is available under the Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 IGO license (CC BY 3.0 IGO) http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/igo. Under the Creative Commons Attribution license, you are free to copy, distribute, transmit, and adapt this work, including for commercial purposes, under the following conditions:

**Attribution**—Please cite the work as follows: "From Workfare to Well-Being - A Randomized Evaluation of the Effects of the STEP Labor – Intensive Public Works Program on the Urban Poor in Eastern DRC" World Bank, Washington, DC. License: Creative Commons Attribution CC BY 3.0 IGO.

**Translations**—If you create a translation of this work, please add the following disclaimer along with the attribution: This translation was not created by The World Bank and should not be considered an official World Bank translation. The World Bank shall not be liable for any content or error in this translation.

**Adaptations**—If you create an adaptation of this work, please add the following disclaimer along with the attribution: This is an adaptation of an original work by The World Bank. Views and opinions expressed in the adaptation are the sole responsibility of the author or authors of the adaptation and are not endorsed by The World Bank.

Third-party content—The World Bank does not necessarily own each component of the content contained within the work. The World Bank therefore does not warrant that the use of any third-party-owned individual component or part contained in the work will not infringe on the rights of those third parties. The risk of claims resulting from such infringement rests solely with you. If you wish to re-use a component of the work, it is your responsibility to determine whether permission is needed for that re-use and to obtain permission from the copyright owner. Examples of components can include, but are not limited to, tables, figures, or images.

All queries on rights and licenses should be addressed to World Bank Publications, The World Bank Group, 1818 H Street NW, Washington, DC 20433, USA; fax: 202-522-2625; e-mail: pubrights@worldbank.org. Images: © World Bank China. Further permission required for reuse.

## FROM WORKFARE TO WELL-BEING

# A Randomized Evaluation of the Effects of the STEP Labor - Intensive Public Works Program on the Urban Poor in Eastern DRC



In Bunagana, Goma, the school classroom bears the marks of years of conflict.

Photo Credit: World Bank

# Did you know?

Even with the formal end to the Congolese wars, post conflict and fragile states face enormous challenges with regards to growth, human development and security.

Throughout DRC, **basic infrastructure** such as schools and health facilities **is lacking**, due to destruction and/or a lack of investment.



A new power line being installed in Majengo, one of the poorest neighborhoods of Goma.

Photo Credit: World Bank

#### Context

Instability in the Eastern Congo region over the past three decades has frequently resulted in outright violent conflict with catastrophic results leaving millions of people dead, and millions of others plunged into acute vulnerability. The international community has been actively involved in efforts to end conflict and to support economic recovery in Eastern DRC, as part of broader efforts to re-establish peace and security in the region. The World Bank supports these efforts in part through the International Development Association (IDA)-funded Productive Opportunities for Stabilization and Recovery in the DRC (STEP, in its French acronym), being implemented by the Social Fund of the DRC (FSRDC) in North Kivu, South Kivu, and Oriental Province. The livelihood and employment generation component includes a labor-intensive public works (LIPW) program, which embeds an impact evaluation (IE) study undertaken by DIME.

#### Intervention

LIPW programs provide temporary employment opportunities and earnings to vulnerable households and individuals in both urban and rural areas through infrastructure projects, hence improving community assets. Specific program elements including the type of infrastructure projects, the transfer amount etc. may vary by country. While there is extensive literature on the impacts of LIPW with early studies such as Subbarao (1994) finding positive impacts on poverty reduction and income and later ones including Gallaso (2004) reporting opposite results, the evidence on the effects of LIPW programs, comprising additional components and/or implanted in fragile contexts, is scant. This IE will aim to fill this knowledge gap by informing whether LIPW programs combined with training and savings, that seek to increase the likelihood of long-term impacts, effectively reduce poverty among populations affected by violent conflict.

Targeted Cities: Bukavu, Goma, Bunia, Beni, and Butembo

LIPW Activities: Garbage collection, street cleaning and road maintenance

#### **Project Key Characteristics:**

- Approximately 6000 beneficiaries
- Those eligible (adult and able) enroll to a list stratified by gender
- Paid \$3 a day for working four days a week for 4 months
- A subset of beneficiaries in addition to the public works will also get: i) savings account, and ii) an extensive training program













#### **Research Questions**

- 1. What is the impact of LIPW on economic outcomes such as income, spending, saving, investment, employment and on socio-psychological ones such as social cohesion, inter-family conflict, mental well-being, the propensity to be engaged in illegal activities and schooling among others?
- 2. What is the added impact of a training program on the above outcomes?
- 3. What is the added impact of a training program on the above outcomes?
- 4. What is the added impact of a training and savings program on the above outcomes?

#### **Evaluation Methodology**

The impact evaluation was designed as a randomized controlled trial to determine what would have happened in the absence of the program. Individuals are randomly assigned to the LIPW program through a lottery. There are four treatment arms and a control group with the below sample sizes:

- 1. LIPW-500 Individuals
- 2. LIPW plus training- 500 Individuals
- 3. LIPW plus savings- 500 Individuals
- 4. LIPW plus training and savings- 500 Individuals
- 5. Control- 500 Individuals

#### Census Survey



Settina: Urban

Location: Five largest Congolese cities in Eastern Congo: Beni, Bukavu, Bunia, Butembo, and Goma Sample size: 3727 Individuals



#### **Preliminary Findings**

Baseline results show that the typical household in the sample is poor, the data implying that the median HH lives below US\$1 per day, with necessities accounting for over 80% expenditures. This is exacerbated with lack of predictable income stream, with half of sample facing unemployment. They also face barriers financial in accessing education and health services as well as starting their own businesses.

The social cohesion outcomes fare better although psychological ones such as mental stress do not fare well. A minority, less than 10% of the sample, has engaged in conflicts, however, those who have come mostly from migrant populations. One-third of the sample belongs to associations, which reflects strongly on the household's resilience. The sample reported high levels of trust in family members and neighbors.

### **Demographic**



- The median household in the sample has 6 members
- In 74% of households, one individual+ fell ill in last year
- The median schooling attainment is 4th year of secondary school

#### **Economic**



- US\$82 is monthly consumption
- 12.5% of households have savings
- 41.7% of respondents has a job
- Men & those educated more likely to have job
- 84% report lack of financial means as main barrier to microbusiness creation
- 35% of sample received

some professional training





#### Gender Component

Given women generally receive fewer employment opportunities and fare lower in employment outcomes compared to their male counterparts, the LIPW program includes a 50% male and 50% female gender quota to select individuals into the program.

#### Policy and Program Lessons

LIPW is a popular social-safety net model across developing countries because of the presumed socio-economic impacts but program design is critical:

- The target population is poor and underemployed so they are likely to respond positively to the \$3per day program. The transfer amount should be tailored to the target beneficiaries.
- The data highlights that the population faces capital constraints and savings are low which prevents them from coping with shocks. Hence it is beneficial to test out different program elements and focus on program design that is in line with the local context.
- Since the target population has low education, low professional training are engaged in small businesses/self-enterprises, it may be beneficial to offer extended training, however, it is important to focus on the design of the skills training and weight the tradeoffs between keeping it generic to basic skills or catering to specific skills.

# Social & Psychological



- 31.4% of sample HH have one member+ in associations
- 83% of sample voted in 2011 elections
- 13.5% of respondents suffer from low self-esteem



